ISSN: 1139-0107 ISSN-E: 2254-6367

MEMORIA Y CIVILIZACIÓN

ANUARIO DE HISTORIA

21/2018

REVISTA DEL DEPARTAMENTO DE HISTORIA,
HISTORIA DEL ARTE Y GEOGRAFÍA
FACULTAD DE FILOSOFÍA Y LETRAS
UNIVERSIDAD DE NAVARRA

Isabel Corte-Real

The Modernization of Public Administration in Portugal, 1950s - 1970s

La modernización de la Administración Pública en Portugal, 1950-1970 pp. 455-478 [1-24]

DOI: 10.15581/001.21.004



The Modernization of Public Administration in Portugal, 1950s-1970s

La modernización de la Administración Pública en Portugal, 1950-1970

ISABEL CORTE-REAL

Independent consultant 1 Isabel.cortereal@cortereal.eu

RECIBIDO: MARZO DE 2018 ACEPTADO: MAYO DE 2018

Resumen: El propósito de este artículo es abordar el proceso de modernización de la administración pública en Portugal desde la década de 1950 hasta la década de 1970, un período ampliamente caracterizado por políticas creadas e implementadas por Salazar como Presidente del Consejo de Ministros, durante sus 36 años de gobierno (1932-1968). Este trabajo se basa en la evidencia empírica recopilada de diversas fuentes y escrita desde la perspectiva de un funcionario. En definitiva, se deriva de la experiencia profesional del autor, que desde 1970 en adelante participó personalmente en la gestión pública, la formulación de políticas y la implementación.

Palabras clave: Portugal. 1950-1974. Adminisración Pública. Servicio civil. Reformas de la gestión pública. Dictadura de Salazar. Gobierno de Caetano. Revolución democrática, 1975. Nuevas demandas democráticas. Generación de capacidades (74-79). Abstract: The purpose of this article is to address the modernization process of public administration in Portugal from the 1950s to 1970s, a period largely characterised by policies created and implemented by Salazar as President of the Council of Ministers, during 36 years of government (1932-1968). This paper is based on empirical evidence collected from various sources and written from the perspective of a practitioner. It derives from the professional experience of the author, who from 1970 onwards was personally involved in public management, policy formulation and implementation.

Keywords: Portugal. 1950-1974. Public Administration. Civil Service. Public Management Reforms. Salazar dictatorship. Caetano's government. Democratic revolution, 1974. New Democratic Demands. Capacity building (74-79).

to adpublic 50s to policies Presi-6 years s based various ve of a esssional 1970 public elemen-

¹ The author was Secretary of State for Administrative Modernization (1989-1995) in Portuguese Government and Director General of the European Institute of Public Administration, EIPA Maastricht (1996-2000).

INTRODUCTION

The author would like to acknowledge that this review is written from the perspective of a practitioner and hence represents a different approach to the Authors of the other papers of this Special issue on the theme *La modernización española bajo el segundo franquismo*.

Having joined the civil service in 1970 as a technical officer and being personally involved in the Portuguese administrative reform process until 1995, this review is shaped by the author's professional experience both as a manager and in politics as Secretary of State for Administrative Modernization (1989/1995). Thus, the article extensively reflects the author's own experience in formulating and implementing public management policies and reforms, and also her own perception and analysis. It encompasses a brief literature review on public management reform in Portugal as well.

Although the focus of the article is on policies devised and carried out from the 1950s to 1970s, it is relevant to acknowledge that the civil service system created in 1935², during the Portuguese dictatorship period, survived as the *backbone* of civil service and human resources payment system until very late —it was only completely abolished in 1989³—. Therefore, the reforms that took place during that period are also covered here in some detail. Public Administration was not perceived as a priority during the time covered by this paper and one could consider that Salazar's main concern after seizing power was the fiscal reform. On this reform, Salazar summarized in his own words, his own historical perspective:

(...) entendi que se reclamava ansiosamente, aflitivamente, como condição essencial de salvação publica, sem possível discordância, sem discussão possível, o equilíbrio real do orçamento e das contas, seriedade e rigor na execução dos contratos; simplificação na contabilidade de modo a saberse em cada momento o que se arrecada, o que se paga, o que se tem e o que se deve; reforma da tesouraria e das suas nebulosas operações; consolidação da dívida flutuante; amortização da dívida externa; diminuição das taxas de juro; conversão da dívida pública; valorização dos títulos; re-



² Decreto-lei (Decree-law) 26 115, 23/11/1935.

³ Decreto-lei (Decree-law) 184/89,02/06/1989.

When defending his vision, Salazar was assertive and used *grand* expressions, while being most often discreet in his public appearances. The fragment above highlights the absence of doubt on the importance of the financial reforms: «... I understood that the actual balance of budget and public accounts (...) was **eagerly claimed** (...) without any disagreement, without any discussion, as **an essential requirement for public salvation**...».

The balance of public accounts was quickly achieved in the beginning of Salazar's mandate, as was the valuation of the exchange rate of the Portuguese *Escudo*. News reports account for the rustling in Lisbon when three tons of imported gold arrived to secure the gold reserves in Bank of Portugal and to guaranty parity of the *Escudo* to the gold standard⁵. To Salazar these policies —the balance of public accounts, credibility of Portuguese *Escudo*, political stability of the country— were of overwhelming importance to the external image of the country in Europe and in the international scene.

At the end of 1930s and until the term of Salazar's government, priority was given to external policy and relations. Salazar had an exclusive involvement in the critical and sensitive issues of World War II, aimed at pursuing Portuguese neutrality. Being in charge of the general policy of the country as *President of the Council of Ministers*, Salazar decided to also be politically responsible for external affairs, becoming *Minister of Foreign Affairs* at the same time. From the 60s onwards the



Nogueira, 1977, p. 244. «(...) I understood that the actual balance of the budget and public accounts, seriousness and rigor in executing [public] contracts was eagerly claimed, anxiously, as an essential requirement for public salvation, without disagreement or discussion; simplification in accounting so as to know in each moment what is collected, what is paid, what one has and what one owes; reform of the treasury and its obscure operations; consolidation of floating debt; amortization of foreign debt; decrease in interest rates; conversion of public debt; valuation of securities; reduction of nominal debt; enlargement and remodelling of registered debt; fiscal reform towards simplicity and justice; better revenue collection; reform of the issuing bank, currency stabilization, convenient currency circulation; debugging and stretching of credit...)». *All the article's translations by the author.*

⁵ Menezes, 2010, p. 98.

colonial war in several fronts absorbed both political energy and resources. Public administration was not a priority.

Caetano was the political successor to Salazar, after confirmation that Salazar would not recover from a serious stroke (1968-1974). Caetano set up the so called *Ala Liberal* (liberal wing) within the *Partido da União Nacional*. Caetano's policies were perceived as a relief to Salazar's regime, however brief and unsuccessful —Caetano's mandate ended in 1974, with the Revolution on 25th April—. His approach was generally incremental and public administration was no exception. Hence, one cannot speak about radical public management reform in his government.

It is also relevant to mention that public management reform issues are not covered in depth by the biographers and authors who wrote extensively about Salazar⁷—both before and after the Portuguese Revolution (1974)—. Still, it is interesting to read Salazar's perspective on his own achievements during the last years of his political life. Nogueira⁸ describes Salazar's thoughts in some detail:

... Nogueira descreve as preocupações últimas do presidente do conselho do seguinte modo: Salazar debruça-se sobre o conjunto de realizações, e desabafa com alguns íntimos: "O país não tinha quase nada, foi preciso fazer tudo desde o zero em quase todos os domínios. Como temos trabalhado na medida dos nossos recursos, pulverizámos estes em mil miudezas, indispensáveis e úteis no conjunto, mas miudezas. Não deixaremos nada de grande^o.

Having introduced the theme and scope of the article, its structure is based on eight main domains and subjects:

1. Economic, financial and social indicators.

Universidad
de Navarra

Departamento de Historia.
Historia del Arte y Geograf

União Nacional was the only political party, constitutionally represented in the *Assembleia Nacional* (National Parliament).

⁷ Ferro, 1977, Nogueira, 1977 y Menezes, 2010.

⁸ Alberto Franco Nogueira was a close Minister to Salazar (Foreign Affairs; 1961-1970) and a well known biographer of Salazar.

⁹ Menezes, 2010 p. 651. «(...) Nogueira describes the last concerns of the president of the council as follows: Salazar focuses on a set of achievements, and lets out this comment to intimate friends: "The country had almost nothing, it was necessary to go back to square one in almost every domain. As we have worked to the extent of our own resources, we have shattered these in thousands of small things, indispensable and useful as a whole, but small things. We will not leave anything big)».

- 2. 1935: the dictatorship reform of public administration.
- 3. The incremental and small amendments of the 1950s.
- 4. The 1960s The measures of Marcello Caetano (68 -74) and general trends.
- 5. How did the civil service system evolve in the dictatorship era?
- 6. The new democratic demands: main achievements after 1974.
- 7. Brief remarks on the evolution of the Portuguese reform process after 1979.
- 8. Concluding remarks.

1. ECONOMIC, FINANCIAL AND SOCIAL INDICATORS

To better understand this period of the Portuguese administrative history it is worth revisiting a few economic and social development indicators from the 1950s to the 1970s. Although the existing statistical resources are scarce, data still provides interesting indicators:

Growth in Gross Domestic Product (GDP)¹⁰

1961	3.58%
1962	10.53%
1970	8.4%
1971	10.49%

It was a decade of significant growth for Portuguese economy and the first time¹¹ that its growth was higher than the average of the *Europe* of the 15. Nevertheless, in spite of the fiscal and economic situation, public management reform was not high in the political Agenda:

- The percentage of GDP allocated to Defence was significantly high. In 1972 it was 4.3%, while Healthcare's was 0.2% and Education $1.4\%^{12}$.
- The GDP *per capita* (referred to constant prices 2011) was 3.463 Euros/year in 1960. In 2015 the same indicator was 16.578 Euros/year.

11 Ramos, Vasconcelos e Sousa and Monteiro, 2009, p. 689.



¹⁰ Pordata

¹² In 2016, Defense retained 1%; Education and Health 3.9% and 4.8% respectively *(provisional; Pordata)*.

- The illiteracy rate in 1960 was around 32% in Portugal, and 25.7% in 1970 (moving to 18.6% in 1981 and 5.2% in 2011¹³).
- There is no reliable data available on employment rates. However, the 60s registered high emigration rates¹⁴, fuelled by the search of better opportunities abroad from the Portuguese workforce and for political reasons.
- Also, at the time of the colonial war (1961-1974) Portugal sustained a significant war effort in different colonial fronts —Guinea-Bissau, Angola, Mozambique and Timor-. A sizable portion of the population was involved in the war effort¹⁵. As a consequence, unemployment was low at the time.
- Data on public employment¹⁶ is also known. In 1935, Public Administration employed 25.000 staff members. In 1969 the number had increased to 165.000¹⁷; 468.625 in 1986 and 638.938 in 1996¹⁸.
- Public accounts were balanced (no deficit) in the 50s and the 70s, presenting a comfortable superavit - even in 1973, one year prior to the 25th April 1974 revolution. No additional fiscal resources were required to finance Public Administration¹⁹.

To sum up, prior to the Carnation Revolution, from 1950's to 1970s, Portuguese Public Administration was not high in the political agenda even though the fiscal and economic situation of the country would have allowed it to be. Defence and colonial war mobilised significant resources.

2. 1935: THE DICTATORSHIP REFORM OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

As previously stated, the focus of this article is on policies carried out between the 50s and the 70s. Nevertheless, the civil service system created in 1935, during the dictatorship, carried on for a significant time;

¹⁴ Source: Chart on *Portuguese emigration between 1855-1988,* Ramos, Vasconcelos e Sousa and Monteiro, 2009, pp. 780-781.



¹³ Pordata (quoted).

¹⁵ According to published information the war effort involved over one million men between 1961-1974 and around 117.000 soldiers, every year, in the several colonial fronts, Monteiro, 2013; Vilela and Mrozowski, 2016.

¹⁶ According to the reporting system and administrative tradition this includes all public employees paid by the state budget.

¹⁸ Sistema de Informação estatístico das administrações públicas.

Banco de Portugal: <u>Receitas e despesas das administrações públicas 1947-1995</u>.

hence it is also relevant to include this period of modernization initiatives.

What was Salazar's diagnosis of the state of public administration when he seized power? Salazar did not write extensively about the subject, however, his *Speeches* (*Discursos*) refer to a *complete lie in public service*... Under the heading *a policy of truth, sacrifice and national policy* the politician conveys in his *Speeches* his thoughts on the actual problems of Public Administration:

(...) A mesma política de verdade impõe atitudes mentais e morais diferentes, em face de certos problemas.

A falta de coincidência entre instituições e os seus fins, entre a aparência dos preceitos e a sua realidade profunda, entre a lei e a sua execução, faz da vida administrativa do país uma mentira colossal.

Se temos um vencimento e a seu lado a acumulação ou o cofre de emolumentos, temos a mentira dos ordenados.

Se temos um número de funcionários para um trabalho e parte deles desligados do serviço, porque aguardam uma aposentação que não chega, temos a mentira dos quadros.

Se o funcionário tem outra vida que não a de funcionário e não está à hora que deve, e não trabalha com zelo durante o tempo de serviço, e as faltas não são nunca averiguadas, nem julgadas, nem rapidamente punidas, temos a mentira disciplinar.

Se temos fixado um período de pagamento de dívidas e esse período é sucessivamente prorrogado, temos a mentira dos prazos.

Se temos um orçamento equilibrado, mas as receitas foram avaliadas em mais e as despesas foram artificialmente realizadas abaixo do que hão-de ser, temos a mentira das previsões, mentira das contas, mentira do estado industrial (indústrias do Estado) mentira da função pública, mentira da justiça»²⁰.



[«]Política de verdade, política de sacrifício, política nacional», Salazar, 1935, pp. 21-26. «(...) The same policy of truth imposes different mental and moral attitudes when facing certain problems. The lack of coincidence between the institutions and their ends, between the apparent precepts and their profound reality, between a law and its execution, makes the administrative life of the country a colossal lie. If you look at a salary and by its side the accumulation or total fees, there is the lie of the wages. If there are a number of employees for a job and part of them are disconnected from it because they are waiting for a retirement that does not arrive - the lie of the cadres. If the employee has another life, not as an employee, and is not at work on time, does not work with zeal

As a consequence of this extremely critical diagnosis a Decree-law was passed in 1935²¹.

Hence, how was the need for a new legal framework brought forth? A set of specific arguments were aligned²² with this purpose:

- The extreme diversity of payments for the same jobs.
- The opacity of the supplements: the fringe benefits and supplements have «the science of complexity, but cannot be justified», [«(...) têm a ciencia da complicação mas não se podem justificar»].
- Irrationality: fake promotions to hide the modesty of the salaries and payments.

When a few sectors of Portuguese society, namely the armed forces, questioned the civil service reform, a certain tension was felt. Some sectors perceived they were entitled to any benefits of a new civil service payment system. Salazar was clear²³, the political aim was to *rationalize* and spare resources. Armed forces and other groups should not fear to be excluded from the supposed benefits. Public expenditure could not be increased; hence the new payment system would always *take from some,* what will be given to others:

(...) Pode ter causado dolorosa impressão dizer-se que se está trabalhando na reforma dos vencimentos do funcionalismo civil (...).Em primeiro lu-

while on duty and absences are never investigated, judged, nor quickly punished, there is the lie of discipline. If there is a set period for debt payment and that period is successively extended, there is the lie of the deadlines. If we have a balanced budget but the revenues were overvalued and expenses were artificially lowered to under what they should be, we have the lie of forecasts, the



lie of the accounts, lie of industrial state (State industries), lie of the civil service, lie of justice». ²¹ Decreto-lei 26 115, 23.12.1935.

²² Preamble.

The military coup of 1926, lead by *General Gomes da Costa*, led to the final days of the first republic introducing dictatorship that followed the Parliament's closure. The army received privileged attention from Salazar. «*Durante a longa vida do regime o exército era a instituição à qual Salazar era mais suscetível. No entanto é claro que subordinação à hierarquia, resultado do regime, era um facto em congéneres da II Guerra mundial. O processo foi lento e sujeito a inúmeras tentativas, mas o movimento para centralizar e controlar a elite militar foi o elemento certo da consolidação do regime»;* «During the long life of the regime, the army was the institution to which Salazar was most susceptible to. However, it is clear that subordination to the hierarchy, resulting from the regime, was an analogue fact to World War II. The process was slow and subject to numerous attempts, but the movement to centralize and control the military elite was the right element of the regime's consolidation » (*Costa Pinto* quoted by *Filipe Ribeiro Menezes*, p146); As the opposition forces to the regime were controlled politically, it is not difficult to anticipate that turbulence (as a risk to the regime) would likely come from the Armed Forces.

gar como as minhas reformas são em geral para pagar menos e receber mais é raro que os interessados tenham razão para pressas. Por outro lado. Não se trata de vencimentos. **Mas da regularização de vencimentos e quadros, visto não poder aumentar a despesa e dever portanto tirar a uns o que haja de ser dado a outros.**

Nós temos antes de mais, de sistematizar os serviços, composição dos quadros, as categorias dos funcionários, porque sem esse trabalho prévio, quanto mais se tocar nos vencimentos, mais injustiças se cometem.

O que acima de tudo se pretende é por ordem nesta desordem (...) designadamente diferenças de salários de funcionários de igual categoria e grande disparidade com o privado²⁴.

Nevertheless, although Salazar defended a rather moderate civil service payment policy, he expressed concerns about the low level of payment for certain qualified jobs, especially managers:

(...) É grave para a Nação que a burocracia não possua competência e qualidades de trabalho para bem se desempenhar da administração pública, e não as poderá ter, se não distinguir os vencimentos dos dirigentes, o Estado não conseguir as condições indispensáveis para concorrer com a economia privada na preparação e recrutamento dos chefes de serviço²⁵.

If this was the diagnosis, what were the solutions? In brief, the new provisions pursued the following aims:

- To reduce staff numbers and public employment.
- Rationalize *staff cadres*²⁶, structures and reduce hierarchical levels.



MEMORIA Y CIVILIZACIÓN 21 (2018): 455-478 [1-24]

Salazar, 1935, p. 99. «(...) It may have made painful impression to say that one is working on the reform of civil service salaries (...). Firstly, as my reforms are generally to pay less and receive more, interested parties are usually not in a hurry. On the other hand (...) It is not a question of salaries. It is about the regularization of salaries and cadres, as one cannot increase the expense and must, therefore, take from some, what will be given to others. First of all, we must systematise services, the composition of the cadres, the categories of employees, as without this previous work the more we tamper with salaries, more injustices are done. What is intended above all is to bring some order to this disorder (...) namely the differences in salaries between employees of the same category and a great disparity with the private sector)».

²⁵ Preamble Decree-law 26 115, 23/11/1935.«(...) It is a serious matter to the Nation that bureaucracy does not exhibit competences and work skills so that public administration can be performed well, and that it will continue not to if [bureaucracy] doesn't distinguish salaries in leading positions, if the State does not achieve the essential conditions to compete with the private economy in preparing and recruiting heads of service)».

²⁶ Cadres that established staff needs in law, both in quantity (number of positions to be fulfilled) and competences.

- Reduce the number of job positions.
- Reduce the diversity of payments and make the payment levels uniform.
- Organize payment levels by alphabetical order (each letter corresponding to a payment level from *A to Z,* A being the highest payment position and Z the lowest).
- Give qualified staff with higher education training a special status; benefit from a special career and payment levels (this was the case for judges, diplomats, university professors, librarians, veterinaries, etc...).

Two interesting assumptions lied with the new legal provisions passed in 1935:

- Firstly, the idea that salary level could make up for civil servants honour and loyalty was totally rejected:
 - «(...) não há qualquer relação estabelecida entre os vencimentos e fidelidade ou honradez dos funcionários públicos»²⁷.

Despite the cultural values behind this statement, it meets the practices of moderate salaries adopted at the time, afforded by the fiscal situation. This was always one of the keys to Salazar's policies.

- Secondly, the statement that

«Tudo se fez ou procurou fazer sem violências ou com o mínimo delas» 28 .

Both these ideas follow the ideology of the regime. There were no political parties in Parliament to argue or scrutinize the new public administration law, no negative comments or threats from media or public opinion, as these were subject to censorship and no legal strikes to be faced.

It should be taken into account that this short statement could only correspond to the past. It could never be issued after the 1974 revolution in Portugal.

In a Democracy, the process of reform and management of change is complex, both from a social and political point of view, bearing ten-



3

Preamble Decree-law 26 115, 23/11/1935. «...there is no relation between civil servants' wages and loyalty or honour and their level of payment...».
 Preamble Decree-law 26 115, 23/11/1935. «... everything was done without violence, or minimiz-

²⁸ Preamble Decree-law 26 115, 23/11/1935. «... everything was done without violence, or minimizing it...».

sions and conflicts that seek political and social commitment and compromise. The constitutional role of the different political institutions is of the essence. Bargaining with trade unions is necessary. Media and public opinion are there to inform and scrutinize policies and their social, political and economic impact. Nowadays, managing reforms is a very rich, yet, complex and time consuming social and political process²⁹.

3. THE INCREMENTAL AND SMALL AMENDMENTS OF THE 50s

The 1950s and 1960s featured an incremental approach to public administration in Portugal, translated into small amendments in the system.

The changes can be summarized as follows³⁰:

- A salary complement was set in 1943 and 1948. While in the beginning it was conceived as a provisional payment solution, it was later maintained as a complement, amounting to 75% to 80% of the basic salary for each job. This salary complement was kept until the end of the 50s and 60s.
- In 1958, the number of payment positions was reduced. The positions were confined to levels *A* to *Y* (the lower salaries corresponding to levels *Z*, *Z'*, and *Z''* were abolished).
- The *Presidency of the Council of Ministers* refer to a postponed ambition for a more radical civil service reform when these legal provisions were passed (the salary complement, initially designed as a provisional fringe benefit reached 80% of the monthly salary), but very modest approaches were taken and no real modernization measures were carried out.

One can guess how uncomfortable the authorities would have felt about the *adhoc* payment amendments carried out repeatedly. It is worth recalling the words of the President of the Council of Ministers, during the early days of his mandate, about complements and fringe benefits: they had *the science of complexity, but they cannot be justified.*



MEMORIA Y CIVILIZACIÓN 21 (2018): 455-478 [1-24]

²⁹ The new payment system adopted in 1989, on which the Author was personally involved —that finally abolished legal provisions of 1935— demanded an intense process of negotiation, both at political and social level.

Comissão para o estudo dos sistemas retributivos da função pública em Portugal, 1987, pp. 17-18.

4. The 1960s - The measures of Marcello Caetano (68 -74) and general trends

Marcello Caetano was the successor of Salazar as President of the Council of Ministers. A well-known and respected University Professor, who taught Portuguese administrative and constitutional law³¹. Caetano is the author of a handbook of Administrative Law that is still a reference to public administration and law experts.

In his handbook, Caetano describes a Public administration concept with the main objective of providing services to meet public needs, subordinated to rule of law³². Taking into account his academic competences, qualifications and background it can be said that modernizing public administration was not indifferent to Marcello Caetano's ambitions both as politician and an academic.

Caetano's main achievements are part of a number of decree-laws passed mainly in 1969. The main trends of these provisions can be summarized as follows:



- General increase in the payment system; previous complements and fringe benefits became part of the monthly salaries.
- New grading of jobs, reduction of job positions: careers and jobs became more consistent.
- Working conditions were improved —including those who had fixed-term contracts, social services were put in place for civil servants—.

³¹ Caetano's political role is not the focus of this paper. To better understand his relation to Public Administration after Salazar it is worth to mention some milestones of his career. Marcello Caetano was a Minister of Salazar's government, a former Rector of the University of Lisbon, a prominent Professor and Academic on the field of administrative and constitutional law. His efforts to make a regime transition to new winds of history, namely in relation to decolonization, are part of the so-called "Primavera Marcelista" (literary Marcelist Spring). He was responsible for the creation of a liberal wing (called ala liberal) in the Parliament, as a modernizing political movement within the only political party of the regime, União Nacional. Marcello Caetano was seen as a mediator, following Salazar's path. To the liberals he conveyed that the liberalization process could not be faster due to the far-right forces (the so called ultras), to the ultras Caetano suggested that he needed to turn to the liberals, as other political forces were absent. He feared that the ample freedom claimed by the opposition would destroy what he considered to be a moderate regime. According to Caetano, a revolution would be open to persecution, hate and terror. (Ramos, Vasconcelos e Sousa and Monteiro, 2009, p. 699). Marcello Caetano was sent to exile as a consequence of the military coup of 25th April 1974 (Carnation revolution).

³² Caetano, 2010, p. 5.

- Special career and payment focus was given to the grupo de pessoal técnico (technical officers) enhancing the expertise required for the country's economic development.
- Creation of institutions to modernize public administration, starting a small scale capacity building operation (Secretariado da Reforma Administrativa and Secretariado da Administração Pública)33.

5. HOW DID THE CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM EVOLVE IN THE DICTATORSHIP ERA?

When looking at and assessing the above mentioned period, we could ask about the result and impact of these amendments and postponed reforms. It is well established that the 1935 public service reform had a real impact, and its effects persisted for a long time, framing future developments. One can consider, however, that the modernization carried out afterwards, from the 50s to the 70s, was timid and unambitious.

It can be considered that the Portuguese administrative system stagnated in the period under analysis here and that the morale of civil servants was probably low.

The weaknesses of the system are briefly listed below:

- The oath sworn when joining public service prior to 1974 was an indicator of the atmosphere of unease within it³⁴. Recently, going over old drafts, I found some lines I had written on the subject. In general terms, one was asked to act according to the Constitution and the law. However, the Constitution forbid the creation of political parties, limited the freedom of association and freedom of expression by complying with censorship. A secret political police was legally established. For (most) civil servants, the oath was as a sign of submission and restricted political rights.



³³ Moniz, 2016.

³⁴ «Afirmo solenemente pela minha honra ser fiel à minha Pátria, cooperar na realização dos fins superiores do Estado, defender os princípios da ordem social e política da constituição, respeitar as leis do Estado e dedicar ao serviço publico todo o meu zelo, inteligência e aptidão » (I solemnly declare to be faithful to my Country, cooperating with the fulfillment of the superior aims of the State, defending the social and political principles of the Constitution, complying with the State laws and dedicating all my zeal, intelligence and aptitude to civil service) was the oath in use when the author joined civil service (1970) in the Ministry of the Overseas (Decreto 46 982, 27.04.1966, Artigo 85°). The former oath (1933) was explicit in repudiating communism and subversive ideas.

After 1974, contrasting with the past, civil servants could finally say the words of new oath with no hesitation. Honour, loyalty, commitment and mission were mentioned in the new statement, as part of the public ceremony that takes place when joining public service:

Eu abaixo assinado, afirmo, solenemente pela minha honra, que cumprirei com lealdade os deveres que me são confiados.

(I, the undersigned, solemnly declare that I will fulfil the duties that I've been trusted with loyalty)

- Employee appointments were permanent and this included managing and top positions. This was an inadequate solution, particularly when management of change and flexibility was required;
- The staffing *cadres*, which were approved by law, were not suited to the needs of the public bodies, which in turn did not meet public service requirements.
- Promotions were hampered, as vacant positions were often not foreseen in the annual budget; civil servants remained in the same position for several years, without any promotion or reward;
- Salaries were low. The legislator regularly acknowledged, in fact, that there was no longer any equity within the salary system, and also no external competitiveness with the private sector.
- Labour rights were not recognized, as even holidays were devised as licenses and not rights.

One could question if public service policies were that obsolete and dormant. I would say yes, with minor exceptions.

As Portugal was a state governed by the rule of law, even if the law was imperfect, public service legislation contemplated the duty to inform political and administrative leaders of the situation under analysis, in fact or in law (*de jure et de fatu*). Incorrect or hidden information could lead to disciplinary proceedings. This gave public servants the margin for an exercise of impartiality —although often subject to pressure from the hierarchies—supported by the law.

And this value should not be overlooked, either in administrative activities or in administrative procedure, in any context.

On the other hand, with all its faults, the Portuguese Public Administration and public service —that kept most of the civil service staff after 1974, despite the policy of reorganization— were able to respond to vertiginous changes in Portuguese society that demanded immediate change after April 1974.



6. THE NEW DEMOCRATIC DEMANDS: MAIN ACHIEVEMENTS AFTER 1974

The period after 1974 was dominated by the pressure to cope with the new democratic order. Urgent action was demanded. In fact, as it was underlined by Moniz:

(...) o período de 1975 a 1979 corresponde ao auge da época revolucionária e ao início da normalização democrática; tem assim, sentido distinguir nestes períodos de quatro anos uma primeira fase revolucionária que reportamos aos anos de 1975e 1976 e uma segunda fase constitucional (...) o ano de 1975 traz preocupações com o exercício da atividade politica nos serviços públicos (reuniões, afixação de propaganda, e o saneamento dos quadros), enquanto o ano de 1976 deixou as primeiras medidas relacionadas com o direito à greve na função pública e ... direito da associação sindical...³⁵

Let us highlight some facts:

- Until 1974 —and by force of habit, even later—, users of public services were referred to as *«administered»*. Both theories and authors of administrative law often used the term administered, as if indeed the taxpayers and users of public services were subject to an exercise of administrative power, a *by-product* as a result of administrative action and activity. The language gradually changed in the new democratic cycle: the *«administered»* were considered *citizens* in their own right, with economic, political and social rights and duties.
- Shortly after 25 April 1974, civil servants were granted labour rights and the right to negotiate working conditions. Although legislation on collective bargaining was only approved in 1984³⁶, there was no hesitation: the newly formed trade unions, worker groups, worker commissions and the existing professional associations began to negotiate with the new ruling power, avoiding conflict and healing tensions in Portuguese society.

Universidad de Navarra Departamento de Historia, Historia del Arte y Geografi

Moniz, 2016, p. 54. «(...) the years between 1975 and 1979 correspond to the peak of the revolutionary period and the beginning of democratic normalization; it is important to identify in this four-year period a first revolutionary phase from to 1975 and 1976 and a second constitutional phase (...) 1975 brings concerns about the exercise of political activity in public services (meetings, propaganda display and the reorganization of staff), while 1976 features the first measures relating to the right to strike in the civil service and... right to union association...».

³⁶ Lei 45-A/84, 24/02/84.

- Discrimination set in law was abolished. State jobs were open to all Portuguese citizens, with no gender discrimination, as until then specific occupations and careers were reserved solely for men: Custom tax experts, Police, Magistrates, Army, Judiciary, Diplomats, etc.
- The age limit for entry into the civil service (35 years old) was considered discriminatory and was revoked.
- New administrative structures were required as the government had to deal with people's new social, labour and political rights. Hence, **new institutions** were put in place, namely the Directorate-General of the Civil Service (1974), to manage the civil service, conduct civil service reform, and maintain dialogue with the new emerging civil service trade unions. Also the office of the Ombudsman was created (1975), in line with the Nordic tradition of openness and transparency to citizens and society.

Although the period under consideration is focused particularly on events that occurred until 1975, it is worth examining the administrative modernization transition on the period that followed the Portuguese revolution. A few specific initiatives from 1975 to 1979 should be underlined:

- In 1979, a set of rules and regulations were passed to improve the civil service system³⁷ and an incremental approach was adopted. While not radical in terms of reform, the legal package of 1979 as a whole can be perceived as a modernizing initiative.
- The career system was under review and was amended (1979).
- A new discipline to appoint top civil servants to management positions was also needed.

After 1974, all the existing General Directors were replaced and a few cases resolved in labour rights terms —most former General Directors had been appointed for life—.

A new system was adopted in 1979 combining the career and the position systems. This allowed for a more flexible and open recruitment at the top, while ensuring stability at the intermediate level.

The positions of *General Director* and *Deputy General Director* were considered to require both technical and political confidence,

³⁷ The retirement pensions, survival pensions, disciplinary procedures, management positions system and careers systems were reviewed (Decretos -lei 191 A, B, C, D and F/79).

and appointees could then onwards come from outside or inside the Civil Service. The intermediate level positions (*Departmental Directors and Heads of Division*) required career civil servants.

- New legislation on **Cabinet staff** was also passed. Members of government could now appoint their personal advisers freely. A clear boundary was drawn at Cabinet level between the civil service and political confidence staff. However, political advisers were often recruited from within the civil service.
- A new local power emerged after 1974.

The historical context on decentralisation deserves some remarks.

Centralization of the state was favoured after the 1926 military coup that installed Salazar's regime. Municipalities continued to exist for nearly 50 years but mayors (*Presidentes da Câmara*) were in fact appointed by the central Government. They acted as delegates of the central power with quite limited competences and did not have autonomous powers.

In reality a new elected power emerged.

According to the constitution of the Republic, the political and administrative system of the autonomous regions of Azores and Madeira are well established realities³⁸. The autonomy of Azores and Madeira is designed to ensure democratic participation by citizens, the promotion and defense of regional interests, as well as the strengthening of national unity and of the bonds of solidarity between Portuguese citizens.

The Republic's constitution also states that the democratic organisational structure of the state includes the existence of local authorities, namely, on the mainland, parishes, municipalities and administrative regions and municipalities and parishes in the Azores and Madeira. Nevertheless, a subsequent legal Act by the Parliament was required to define the number, competences, geographical territory and boundaries of the administrative regions. In fact, this decision never saw the light of day³⁹.

Actually, setting up regions did not reflect the aspirations of the majority of Portuguese people —in the 1998 referendum 63.5% of the votes were against the creation of regions and this decision still stands today (2017)—. This topic divided the Portuguese society, politicians, and



MEMORIA Y CIVILIZACIÓN 21 (2018): 455-478 [1-24]

³⁸ Articles 225/226, Republic's Constitution.

³⁹ Articles 235, 255, 256, Republic's Constitution.

citizens. Everywhere, in all political families and sectors there were people in favour and against it.

The same cannot be said in relation to local government which received new impetus after 1974.

The first democratic elections for local government (municipalities and parishes) took place in 1976. Local power began to take shape as a reality, not a mere *aspiration*, bringing consistency to the Portuguese democratic process, and actual closeness between the people and elected authorities. In each local power election over 60.000 candidates are elected to different Municipalities and parishes⁴⁰. Hundreds of thousands of candidates run in these elections from different political parties and trends, which is representative of both the involvement and proximity of the populations to local governance. One can state without hesitation that the local power reform was the only reform aimed at decentralisation in the last 40 years and the only successful achievement in this regard on political and administrative level since 1974⁴¹.

If there is any *consensus* in relation to the *achievements of the revolution* for the Portuguese people, *local power* is the likely the most unanimous accomplishment.

Portugal was divided into 18 administrative districts, each headed by a central government representative (*governador civil*/civil governor) with limited powers. The civil governor represented the Government and exercised the powers of oversight within each district. In any case, early on the Constitution announced *the death* of district structures and their governing authorities: the civil governors. It clearly provided that districts would be maintained only as a transitional administrative division, as long as the administrative regions were not instituted *de facto*. The administrative and political position of civil governor was finally abolished in 2011⁴⁵.



⁴⁰ In 2017 the elected local authorities were referred to 308 Municípios (municipalities) and 3092 freguesias (parishes).

⁴¹ Corte Real, 2014.

⁴² Article 291.

⁴³ In 2011, Decreto- lei 114/2011, 30.11-2011 abolished de facto the civil governors position in the framework of the Portuguese financial crisis. Their competences were transferred to other administrative institutions such as Municipalities, National Security Police, National Guard of the Republic and National Protection Civil Authority.

Portugal is still divided into 18 administrative districts for statistical and a few logistic purposes. Five regional coordinating committees also became part of the Administration's structural organi-

Portugal continues to be a rather centralised State, in spite of the impetus and importance of elected powers at local level.⁴⁴.

To sum up, Moniz's remarks about this period are concise yet precise:

O regime modernizou-se e ainda antes disso, rapidamente se ajustou ao tempo democrático, com um conjunto de medidas, apesar de avulsas, que romperam com uma tradição mais autoritária e paternalista...⁴⁵

In short, a giant capacity-building operation happened quickly and quietly — in fact, similar to the one that took place in the latest Member-States to join the European Union (central eastern European countries). Although no formal systematic evaluation has been carried out, I would argue that the reformers achieved their objectives. A more organized civil service emerged, taking into account the new democratic order.

7. Brief remarks on the evolution of the Portuguese reform process after 1979

On the reform process after 1979, two main reforming initiatives should be mentioned:

- In 1989, a new human resources management and remuneration system was approved that abolished Salazar's law of time (1935) and the alphabetical levels remuneration system:



zation at the regional level of the mainland (from the end of 1979 onwards. Their structure and governing bodies suffered amendments over the years, and at a certain stage they were envisaged as an *embryo system* for the future *Regiões Administrativas*. In any case, these are five decentralized bodies with geographical responsibilities corresponding to five regions *Norte*, *Centro*, *Lisboa e Vale do Tejo*, *Alentejo e Algarve*. They are also an extension of central government and answer directly to the Minister(s) in charge of the Environment and Regional Development, who appoints their chairmen. They provide assistance to local authorities, help formulate local and regional plans and monitor their implementation, manage structural funds, and coordinate the activities of specific ministries at regional level (e.g. land-use planning, regional development and the environment). Other several decentralised regional bodies provide services and represent the Central Administration and the services are the service and represent the central Administrations are the services and represent th

Other several decentralised regional bodies provide services and represent the Central Administration vertically, at regional level (education, health, social security, employment, agriculture, industry, environment, fiscal administration, transport, etc.).

Any how it could be interesting to write a full study on Portuguese decentralization policies, institutions and mechanisms as the decentralization subject is not close up till now (2017).

⁴⁴ The human and financial resources allocated to local power continue to be modest (14.7 % of total expenditure of public administrations and 20% of human resources). Services coordination and policies implementation continue to be poor at local level (Corte-Real, 2014).

⁴⁵ Monig 2016 7 76 (1)

⁵ Moniz, 2016, p. 76. «...the regime was modernized and rapidly adjusted to the new democratic order with a package of initiatives that, although piecemeal, broke an authoritarian and paternalistic tradition...».

«The new public service pay scheme was entirely reformulated and replaced by a new index scale for all the professional groups. The two major objectives were to achieve equity, both internally (between different groups of civil servants and different sectors) and externally (when comparing civil service pay schemes with private sector practices) (...). At the time, the payment scheme set up by Salazar was seen as a major problem, a kind of sleeping giant, disturbing the implementation of public policies, the morale of civil servants and raising inequity within public administration» ⁴⁶.

- In 2008, a civil service system more similar to private labour law was adopted. Due to the financial crisis of 2011 the effects of this legislation are currently on hold and its true impact is not yet known at the time of writing.

CONCLUDING REMARKS

After 1935 and until 1974, in the period leading to the revolution of 25 April 1974, Portuguese administrative modernization and public management registered four decades of stagnation. Salazar's personalistic and messianic vision of power was reflected here as it was in other public policies.

Newitt provides the following historical interpretation of the personality and conception of Power by Salazar:

(...) tinha perfeita consciência da fraca estima com que Portugal era tido na Europa e da fragilidade económica, o que significava que os interesses nacionais eram ignorados e o país ficaria à mercê do capitalismo internacional. O seu grande objetivo era tornar Portugal menos dependente das forças externas diplomática e economicamente, e a forma de o fazer foi concentrar o poder nas mãos de um único homem, a um ponto sem paralelo em qualquer Estado moderno. Em 1939, além de ser Presidente do Conselho de ministros, assume a pasta dos Negócios Estrangeiros e da Defesa (...)», «tinha uma preocupação obsessiva pela minúcia de todas as áreas da governação e conseguiu uma concentração de decisão na pessoa do ditador e uma redução da independência de todos os ministros omo do Presidente da Republica 48.



MEMORIA Y CIVILIZACIÓN 21 (2018): 455-478 [1-24]

⁴⁶ Corte-Real, 2000, p. 17.

⁴⁷ It is known that Salazar did not convene the Council of Ministers regularly and frequently met ministers individually.

Salazar's latest biographer, Filipe Ribeiro de Menezes, writes in similar vein. Quoting a conversation between Salazar with his inner circle, Meneses recounts the following comment:

Não posso estar contente – responde Salazar, sacudindo a cabeça –Uma obra de Governo nunca se encontra completa. Há ainda tanto por fazer! E a vida começa a fugir-nos, os anos passam tão depressa...⁴⁹.

This quotation, says Menezes, « (...)indicia uma diluição das fronteiras entre a vida da nação e o trabalho do Governo. Para Salazar, eram uma e a mesma coisa. (...) »⁵⁰.

Menezes concludes the political biography of Salazar with the following words:

Abandonar o poder enquanto ainda era capaz de agir e decidir equivaleria a admitir que poderia ter estado errado no passado e que outros poderiam desempenhar melhor o cargo. Isso ele nunca admitiu⁵¹.

Hence, it is not too much to say that Salazar perceived the work of government as the realization of a man, whose permanence in the world is finite:(...) *life begins to slip away; years go by so fast...*

Nonetheless, is true that despite the tremendous changes that took place in Portugal after 1974⁵², Portuguese Public Administration was able

- A dictatorship (from 1928 to 1974).
- A revolution in 1974, the so-called *Carnation revolution*.
- A short period of political domination by far left-wing parties, during which the economy was nationalised overnight on 11 March 1975.



Newittt, 2012, p. 275: «(...) was well aware that Portugal was held in low esteem in Europe and of its economic fragility, which meant that national interests were ignored and the country would be at the mercy of international capitalism. His main purpose was to make Portugal less dependent on external forces, diplomatically and economically, and the way to do this was to concentrate power in the hands of a single man, unparalleled in any modern State. In 1939, in addition to being President of the Council of Ministers, [Salazar] assumed the post of Foreign Affairs and Defence (...)"," [Salazar] had an obsessive concern with the minutiae of all areas of government and attained the concentration of decision in the person of the dictator and a reduction of the independence of all the ministers as well as of the President of the Republic».

Menezes 2010, p. 651. «I cannot be happy —Salazar replies, shaking his head—. A Government's work is never complete. There is still so much to do! And life begins to slip away, years go by so fast »

⁵⁰ Menezes, 2010, p. 651«suggests the lines between the life of the nation and the work of government are blurred. To Salazar, they were one and the same».

⁵¹ Menezes, 2010, p. 653 «Giving up power while he was still able to act and decide, would be the same as admitting he could have been wrong in the past and that others could do the job better. He never admitted to this».

 $^{^{52}}$ An abridged calendar of political events in Portugal:

to respond to the new democratic order and the needs of the citizens in a short period of time⁵³.

Perhaps this is why the younger generations of leaders and civil servants, post 1974, have dedicated themselves to the future rather than the past. In terms of public management and administration science little was written and researched on the period under analyses by this article.

Allow me to finish this article with a few questions that seem to raise concerns for the coming years:

What will be the future of the Portuguese public administration?

Can we consider that public management has accomplished a complete cycle in the Portuguese Democracy?

I'm convinced that new challenges and cross roads are there to be faced in relation to public management not only in Portugal, but in European administrations. «The apparent absence of an administrative paradigm, the potentially irreversible crisis of the European welfare state (...) the de-motivation of European public servants (...)» were listed by Ongaro⁵⁴ amongst the challenges to be faced.

Authors and practitioners can claim that it is difficult to say whether a new pos bureaucratic paradigm is arriving, encompassing innovative models.

Cristoph Demmke formulated his own doubts in a challenging —and tentative— way:



- The establishment of democracy despite political turmoil and the first parliamentary, presidential and local elections in 1976.
- Creation of the Azores and Madeira Autonomous Regions and new local authorities (redesigning the powers of the municipalities and parishes).
- The reform and stabilisation of the Constitution that provided for new political, social and economic rights such as freedom of expression, labour rights and access to healthcare and education.
- The reprivatisation of the economy and the approval of new constitutional provisions to allow for the reprivatisation of the economy (1989).
- An intense and fast decolonisation process, with more than a half a million refugees returning from the former colonies.
- The integration of 40,000 civil servants from the civil services of the former colonies.
- European Union membership that Portugal joined on 1 January 1986. Portugal's accession to the Euro zone (1999/2000).

The management of the financial and fiscal crisis from 2011 onwards.

⁵⁴ Ongaro, 2016, p. 5.

⁵³ Alpöge and Dacier, 1996, describe the Portuguese experience in public management reform from an external point of view.

(...) in the future public administration will most likely become more complicated and probably more contradictory (...)⁵⁵.

Nevertheless public administrations and civil service systems cannot do without values such as impartiality, rule of law, fairness, equal treatment, transparency and accountability which are at the core of good governance. Public administration will only accomplish its actual mission, the **service to citizens and society**, when inspired by these values and basic principles.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Alpöge, Atila and Liz Dacier, *Putting Citizens First – Portuguese Experience in Public Management Reform*, Paris, OECD-PUMA, 1996.

Caetano, Marcello, Manual de Direito Administrativo, Coimbra, Almedina, 2010, Volume I.

Comissão para o estudo do sistema retributivo da função pública, *Livro Branco, Relatório sobre o sistema retributivo da Função pública, Volume I,* Lisboa, Presidência do Conselho de Ministros, 1987.

Corte-Real, Isabel, «The Regions in Portugal: a challenging theme for citizens, administrators and politicians» in *The Intermediate Level of Government in European States: Complexity versus Democracy*, ed. Tobjörn Larsson, Koen Noemden and Franck Petitville, Maastricht, European Institute of Public Administration, 1999, pp. 315-328.

Corte-Real, Isabel, «Administrative Modernization in Portugal» in *Administrations in transition*, ed. Isabel Corte-Real, Koen Nomden, Michael Kelly, Franck Petitville, Maastricht, European Institute of Public Administration, 2000, pp. 1-22.

Corte-Real, Isabel, «Public Management Reform in Portugal: successes and failures», *International Journal of Public Sector management*, 21, 2, 2008, pp. 205-229.

Corte-Real, Isabel, «Pensar a administração local», Revista da Administração Local, 261, 2014, pp. 265-284.

Demkke, Christoph, «Austerity and Public Administration reform in OECD», REAP. Revista de Administração e Emprego Público, 1, 2015, pp. 76-78.

Ferro, António, Salazar, Aveiro, Edições do Templo, 1977.

Menezes, Filipe Ribeiro, Salazar. Uma biografia política, Alfragide, Edições D. Quixote, 2010.

Moniz, João Vargas, «Breve evocação do regime de trabalho da função pública», RAEP. Revista de Administração e Emprego Público, 3, 2016, pp. 49-79.

Monteiro, Pedro da Silva, «<u>A logística em Portugal na guerra subversiva em África de 1961 a 1974</u>», Revista militar, Agosto-Setembro, 2013.

Newittt, Malyn, *Portugal na História da Europa e do Mundo*, Alfragide, Texto Editora, 2012.

Nogueira, Alberto Franco, Salazar, Coimbra, Atlântida Editora, 1977, Volume II.

Ongaro, Edoardo, «Five challenges for Public Administrations in Southern Europe», RAEP. Revista de Administração e Emprego Público, 3, 2016, pp, 5-14,

Pordata. Base de dados da Fundação Francisco Manuel dos Santos.

Ramos, Rui, Bernardo Vasconcelos e Sousa and Nuno Gonçalo Monteiro, *Historia de Portugal*, Lisboa, Esfera dos Livros, 2009.

Receitas e despesas das administrações públicas 1947-1995.

Salazar, António de Oliveira, Discursos. I (1928-1934), Coimbra, Coimbra Editora, 1935.

de Navarra

Departamento de Historia,
Historia del Arte y Geografia

⁵⁵ Demmke, 2015, pp. 76-78.

Salazar, António de Oliveira, *Discursos. II (1935-1937)*, Coimbra, Coimbra Editora, 1937. Sistema de Informação estatístico das administrações públicas.

Vilela, Joana Stichini and Nick Mrozowski, LX 60, A vida em Lisboa nunca mais foi a mesma, Alfragide, D. Quixote, 2015.

RELEVANT LEGAL PROVISIONS

Decreto- lei 26 115 de 23/11/1935, (payment reform).

Decreto-lei 33 272, 24/11/1943, (provisonal complements on top of salaries).

Lei 2004, 27/2/1945, (new salary complement).

Decreto-lei 35 886,01.10.1946 (consolidation of fringe benefits, extended to retirement pension).

Decreto-lei 37 115, 26.10.1948 (previous salary complements were abolished; a new complement is created -75-80% of monthly salaries).

Decreto-lei 42 046, 23 /12 /1958 (the number of payment levels are reduced).

Decreto-lei 49410, 11/24/1969 (careers).

Decreto-lei 191-A/79, 02/06/1979 (retirement pensions).

Decreto - lei 191-B/79, 02/06/1979 (survival pensions).

Decreto- lei 191-C/79, 02/06/1979 (careers).

Decreto- lei 191-D/79, 02/06/1979 (disciplinary procedures).

Decreto- lei 191-F/79, 02/06/1979 (managers statute).

Lei 45 A-84 de 23/02/1984 (collective bargaining).

Decreto-lei 184/89, 02/06/1989, (basic principles of human resources management in public service).

Lei Constitucional 1/2005, 12.08.2005 (7° Amendement of the Portuguese Constitution and full text of the Constitution).

